

MAR 08 2007

Serial No. 10/020,869  
60130-1294; 00MRA0564**IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

Appellant: Dobson  
Serial No.: 10/020,869  
Filed: December 12, 2001  
Group Art Unit: 3634  
Examiner: Redman, Jerry E.  
Title: VEHICLE DOOR

Mail Stop Appeal Brief- Patents  
Commissioner for Patents  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria VA 22313-1450

**REPLY BRIEF**

Dear Sir:

This is in reply to the Examiner's Answer mailed January 8, 2007. The Examiner's Answer raises one argument which requires some brief response.

**ARGUMENTS****The panel of Queveau is not waterproof**

The claimed invention recites that an entire trim panel is waterproof and defines a waterproof barrier between a wet space and a dry space. The Examiner states that the panel 4 of Queveau is formed from a synthetic material, and is therefore "waterproof." The Examiner appears to be arguing that the panel 4 is waterproof as it is made of a material that is waterproof. However, the panel 4 of Queveau includes a hole 44 and openings that receive grills 61 and 93. Even if the panel 4 is made of a material that is waterproof per se, the existence of the hole 44 and the openings prevent the panel 4 from being waterproof. Appellant is not claiming that the material of the panel 4 is waterproof, but that the entire panel 4 is waterproof.

For example, if a bucket is made of a waterproof material but includes a hole in the bottom, the water would leak from the bucket. Therefore, the entire bucket is not waterproof, even though it is made of a waterproof material.

MAR 08 2007

Serial No. 10/020,869  
60130-1294; 00MRA0564

Larabel also does not disclose any waterproof panel. Therefore, the combination of the references together does not disclose, suggest or teach the claimed invention. The claimed invention is not obvious, and Appellant respectfully requests that the rejection be withdrawn.

### CONCLUSION

For the reasons set forth above, the rejection of all claims is improper and should be reversed. Appellant respectfully requests such an action.

Respectfully Submitted,

CARLSON, GASKEY & OLDS, P.C.



Karin H. Butchko  
Registration No. 45,864  
Attorney for Appellant  
400 West Maple Road, Suite 350  
Birmingham, Michigan 48009

Dated: March 8, 2007

### CERTIFICATE OF FACSIMILE

I hereby certify that the enclosed Reply Brief is being facsimile transmitted to the United States Patent and Trademark Office, 571-273-8300, on March 8, 2007.

  
Karin Butchko

N:\Clients\MERITOR\Files 1001 to 1500\IP01294\Patent\1294replybrief.doc